

**From:** [Shope, John](#)  
**To:** [Leonard Bennett](#)  
**Cc:** [Craig Marchiando](#); [Matt Erausquin](#); [Devata, Pamela](#); [Drury, John](#); [Conroy, Kevin J. \(Associate\)](#)  
**Subject:** RE: Melo - Proposed Stipulation of Dismissal  
**Date:** Wednesday, March 11, 2020 7:52:03 PM

---

Len:

Your demand for arbitration is frivolous. Under Fed. R. Civ. P. 41, “if the plaintiff previously dismissed any federal or state court action based on or including the same claim, a notice of dismissal operates as an adjudication on the merits.” As you will doubtless recall, the case that was pending before Judge Hamilton until earlier today before your voluntary dismissal was the second case filed by Mr. Melo asserting the same claims Zumper. Mr. Melo voluntarily dismissed his earlier suit when he did not receive a further extension of time to respond to a motion to stay pending arbitration. Mr. Melo’s claim is now clearly barred under the doctrine of res judicata, and, should he proceed with the arbitration claim attached to your email below, Zumper will seek the costs of any arbitration under American Arbitration Association Consumer Rule 44(c).

Zumper does not agreed to arbitration in northern Virginia. The parties have already agreed that any arbitration will be held in San Francisco, California, which is a location reasonably convenient to all parties, particularly given the purported scale of Mr. Melo’s claim, the numerous claims that his demand asserts under California law, your history of litigation there, and your colleagues’ membership in the California bar.

Regards, John Shope

John A. Shope  
Foley Hoag LLP  
155 Seaport Boulevard  
Boston, MA 02210  
Tel. (617)832-1233  
Fax (617)832-7000  
[jshope@foleyhoag.com](mailto:jshope@foleyhoag.com)

---

**From:** Leonard Bennett [mailto:[lenbennett@clalegal.com](mailto:lenbennett@clalegal.com)]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 11, 2020 4:57 PM  
**To:** Shope, John <[JJS@foleyhoag.com](mailto:JJS@foleyhoag.com)>  
**Cc:** Craig Marchiando <[craig@clalegal.com](mailto:craig@clalegal.com)>; Matt Erausquin <[matt@clalegal.com](mailto:matt@clalegal.com)>  
**Subject:** Re: Melo - Proposed Stipulation of Dismissal

John -

As we could not hear back from you, we went ahead and filed our AAA arbitration claim.  
Attached.

Case:012000036899.

Please confirm that Zumper agrees to have the case heard in the jurisdiction in which Mr. Melo resides - in Northern Virginia.

Len Bennett

---

**From:** Leonard Bennett  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 11, 2020 1:15:05 PM  
**To:** Shope, John  
**Cc:** Craig Marchiando; Matt Erausquin; Devata, Pamela; Drury, John  
**Subject:** Re: Melo - Proposed Stipulation of Dismissal

John -

Are you opposed to dismissal (vs a stay)? Why?

Len Bennett

Sent from my iPhone

On Mar 11, 2020, at 12:45 PM, Shope, John <[JJS@foleyhoag.com](mailto:JJS@foleyhoag.com)> wrote:

Craig:

Sorry for the slow response – I was on the road yesterday. Zumper will stipulate that Zumper's motion to compel arbitration and to stay proceedings is granted, that the plaintiff is ordered to arbitrate his claims against Zumper, and that the plaintiff's claims in the pending case against Zumper are stayed pending the arbitration. (We believe that the plaintiff's claims against Trade House are subject to arbitration as well, but recognize that that issue is now pending before the court.) We do not agree to your proposed alternative stipulation. Regards, John Shope

John A. Shope  
Foley Hoag LLP  
155 Seaport Boulevard  
Boston, MA 02210

Tel. (617)832-1233  
Fax (617)832-7000  
[jshope@foleyhoag.com](mailto:jshope@foleyhoag.com)

---

**From:** Craig Marchiando [[mailto:craig@clalegal.com](mailto:mailto:craig@clalegal.com)]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 11, 2020 11:37 AM  
**To:** Shope, John <[JJS@foleyhoag.com](mailto:JJS@foleyhoag.com)>  
**Cc:** Leonard Bennett <[lenbennett@clalegal.com](mailto:lenbennett@clalegal.com)>; Matt Erausquin <[matt@clalegal.com](mailto:matt@clalegal.com)>  
**Subject:** Re: Melo - Proposed Stipulation of Dismissal

John:

Following up on this. Thanks.

Craig C. Marchiando  
**CONSUMER LITIGATION ASSOCIATES, P.C.**  
763 J. Clyde Morris Blvd., Suite 1-A  
Newport News, VA 23601  
Telephone: [\(757\) 930-3660](tel:(757)930-3660)  
Facsimile: [\(757\) 930-3662](tel:(757)930-3662)  
[craig@clalegal.com](mailto:craig@clalegal.com)

This message contains information from Consumer Litigation Associates, P.C. which may be confidential and privileged. If you are not the intended recipient and have received this transmission in error, please contact [\(757\) 930-3660](tel:(757)930-3660) to report it.

---

**From:** Craig Marchiando <[craig@clalegal.com](mailto:craig@clalegal.com)>  
**Date:** Tuesday, March 10, 2020 at 10:20 AM  
**To:** "Shope, John" <[JJS@foleyhoag.com](mailto:JJS@foleyhoag.com)>  
**Cc:** Leonard Bennett <[lenbennett@clalegal.com](mailto:lenbennett@clalegal.com)>, Matt Erausquin <[matt@clalegal.com](mailto:matt@clalegal.com)>  
**Subject:** Melo - Proposed Stipulation of Dismissal

John:

We propose filing the attached stipulation in Melo, dismissing claims against Zumper only. Please let us know if you would like to discuss or have edits. Thanks.

Craig C. Marchiando  
**CONSUMER LITIGATION ASSOCIATES, P.C.**

763 J. Clyde Morris Blvd., Suite 1-A  
Newport News, VA 23601  
Telephone: [\(757\) 930-3660](tel:(757)930-3660)  
Facsimile: [\(757\) 930-3662](tel:(757)930-3662)  
[craig@clalegal.com](mailto:craig@clalegal.com)

This message contains information from Consumer Litigation Associates, P.C. which may be confidential and privileged. If you are not the intended recipient and have received this transmission in error, please contact [\(757\) 930-3660](tel:(757)930-3660) to report it.

Any tax advice included in this document and its attachments was not intended or written to be used, and it cannot be used, for the purpose of avoiding penalties under the Internal Revenue Code.

This email message and any attachments are confidential and may be privileged. If you are not the intended recipient, please notify Foley Hoag LLP immediately -- by replying to this message or by sending an email to [postmaster@foleyhoag.com](mailto:postmaster@foleyhoag.com) -- and destroy all copies of this message and any attachments without reading or disclosing their contents. Thank you.

For more information about Foley Hoag LLP, please visit us at [www.foleyhoag.com](http://www.foleyhoag.com).